

1 PETER D. KEISLER  
2 Assistant Attorney General, Civil Division  
3 CARL J. NICHOLS  
4 Deputy Assistant Attorney General  
5 DOUGLAS N. LETTER  
6 Terrorism Litigation Counsel  
7 JOSEPH H. HUNT  
8 Director, Federal Programs Branch  
9 ANTHONY J. COPPOLINO  
10 Special Litigation Counsel  
11 RUPA BHATTACHARYYA  
Senior Trial Counsel  
ANDREW H. TANNENBAUM  
ALEXANDER K. HAAS  
Trial Attorneys  
Email: [tony.coppolino@usdoj.gov](mailto:tony.coppolino@usdoj.gov)  
U.S. Department of Justice  
Civil Division, Federal Programs Branch  
20 Massachusetts Avenue, NW, Rm. 6102  
Washington, D.C. 20001  
Phone: (202) 514-4782  
Fax: (202) 616-8460

*Attorneys for the Defendants*

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA  
SAN FRANCISCO DIVISION**

IN RE NATIONAL SECURITY AGENCY )  
TELECOMMUNICATIONS RECORDS )  
LITIGATION )  
\_\_\_\_\_  
This Document Relates Only To: )  
\_\_\_\_\_  
*Center for Constitutional Rights v. Bush,* )  
(Case No. 07-cv-1115) )  
\_\_\_\_\_  
No. 11-06-cv-01151-VRW  
**MODIFIED STIPULATION AND**  
**PROPOSED ORDER TO SET**  
**BRIEFING AND HEARING**  
**SCHEDULE IN CENTER FOR**  
**CONSTITUTIONAL RIGHTS**  
**V. BUSH, CASE NO. 07-cv-1115**  
Courtroom: 6, 17th Floor  
Judge: Hon. Vaughn R. Walker

## RECITALS

A. Whereas on May 24, 2007, the parties in *Center for Constitutional Rights v. Bush*, (Case No. 07-cv-1115) submitted a stipulation and proposed schedule for further briefing and a hearing on the parties' pending dispositive motions; *see* Docket No. 289 (MDL-1791) and Docket No. 2 (07-cv-1115); and

B. Whereas, pursuant to that stipulation, Defendants filed a supplemental memorandum in connection with the pending motions on June 8, 2007, *see* Docket Nos. 308-310 (MDL-1791) and Docket Nos. 3-8 (07-cv-1115); and

C. Whereas the Court has not yet entered the stipulation previously filed by the parties in *CCR*, and the parties now desire to modify the remaining briefing schedule slightly so that the date for Plaintiffs to file a supplemental memorandum would be extended by one week (from June 29, 2007 to July 6, 2007), as would the date for Defendants to file a reply (from July 20, 2007 to July 27, 2007); and

D. Whereas this modified stipulation would not alter the hearing date of August 9, 2007 that the parties previously proposed for the pending dispositive motions.

The parties therefore submit the following modified stipulation and proposed briefing schedule in this action:

1. *Center for Constitutional Rights v. Bush*, (Case No. 07-cv-1115), is one of the actions pending in this multi-district litigation proceeding, transferred by order of the Judicial Panel on Multi-district Litigation from the United States District Court for the Southern District of New York. This case has been brought against officers of the United States Government in their official capacities and challenges alleged intelligence activities of the National Security Agency. *See CCR Complaint* (Docket for 07-cv-1115, No. 1, Part 2).

2. The transfer of the *CCR* case to this Court was docketed on or about February 23, 2007. *See* Docket No. 1 (07-cv-1115). Prior to its transfer from the Southern District of New York, the parties in *CCR* had briefed respective dispositive motions. The Defendants in *CCR* had filed a motion to dismiss or, in the alternative, for summary judgment, based on an assertion of the state secrets privilege by the United States. *See* Dkt. No. 1 (07-cv-1115) at Parts 12-15.

1 The Plaintiffs in *CCR* had filed a motion for partial summary judgment. *See id.* at Parts 5-9.  
 2 The United States District Court for the Southern District of New York held a hearing on these  
 3 pending motions on September 5, 2006, but did not decide the motions prior to the transfer of  
 4 this case to this Court.

5       3.     No schedule has previously been set in this MDL proceeding for consideration of  
 6 the pending dispositive motions in the *CCR* case and no prior Order of the Court required any  
 7 action in the *CCR* case.<sup>1</sup> Thus, upon taking account of the schedule of proceedings in other  
 8 MDL cases, the parties in *CCR* have negotiated this stipulation for any further briefing and a  
 9 hearing on the motions pending in *CCR*.

10       4.     The Plaintiffs and Defendants in *CCR* have reached agreement on and seek the  
 11 Court's approval of a schedule for the filing of any supplemental briefs in *CCR* and a hearing on  
 12 pending motions in that case. Under the proposed schedule: (i) Defendants in *CCR* filed a  
 13 supplemental brief setting forth additional points and authority concerning the status and  
 14 disposition of the *CCR* case on June 8, 2007; (ii) Plaintiffs in *CCR* would file a response to any  
 15 submission by the Defendants and their own supplemental points and authority by July 6, 2007;  
 16 and (iii) Defendants would file a reply brief by July 27, 2007.

17       4.     The parties also propose that the Court hear the pending motions in *CCR* on  
 18 August 9, 2007. The parties also request that the pending motions in *CCR* be heard separately  
 19 from pending motions in other cases in this MDL proceeding that are scheduled on other dates.<sup>2</sup>

---

21       <sup>1</sup> On February 20, 2007, the Court issued an order granting and denying in part a motion  
 22 by the United States to stay all MDL proceedings pending resolution of an appeal in *Hepting v.*  
 23 *AT&T*, Case No. 06-672. *See* Dkt. No. 172 (06-cv-1791). In that order, the Court directed the  
 24 defendants in pending MDL cases to answer or otherwise respond to the complaint in cases as to  
 25 which a stay was not agreed upon no later than March 29, 2007. Since the Defendants in the  
*CCR* case had already responded to the Complaint in that case with the pending dispositive  
 motion, no schedule for further proceedings was set or required by the Court's February 20  
 Order.

26       <sup>2</sup> The parties conferred with the Court's clerk and determined that the August 9 hearing  
 27 date was available. However, if that date becomes unavailable, the parties request an  
 28 opportunity to confer with each other and the Court before another date is set (in part because  
 counsel for the Government is unavailable the following week).

## STIPULATION

The Plaintiffs and Defendants in the *CCR* action, through their undersigned counsel, hereby stipulate to the following schedule and request that the Court make this stipulation an order of the Court:

1. On June 8, 2007, Defendants in *CCR* filed a supplemental brief setting forth additional points and authority concerning the status and disposition of the *CCR* case (07-cv-1115).
2. On or before July 6, 2007, Plaintiffs in *CCR* will file a response to the Government's submission and their own supplemental points and authority in support of their position on the pending motions.
3. Defendants will file a reply brief by July 27, 2007.
4. On August 9, 2007, at 2 p.m., oral argument will be held on the pending motions in the *CCR* case (07-cv-1115).

DATED: June 26, 2007

Respectfully Submitted,

PETER D. KEISLER  
Assistant Attorney General, Civil Division  
CARL J. NICHOLS  
Deputy Assistant Attorney General  
DOUGLAS N. LETTER  
Terrorism Litigation Counsel  
JOSEPH H. HUNT  
Director, Federal Programs Branch  
ANTHONY J. COPPOLINO  
Special Litigation Counsel  
RUPA BHATTACHARYYA  
Senior Trial Counsel  
ANDREW H. TANNENBAUM  
ALEXANDER K. HAAS  
Trial Attorneys  
U.S. Department of Justice  
Civil Division, Federal Programs Branch  
20 Massachusetts Avenue, NW  
Washington, D.C. 20001  
Phone: (202) 514-4782 — Fax: (202) 616-8460  
Email: [tony.coppolino@usdoj.gov](mailto:tony.coppolino@usdoj.gov)

By: /s Anthony J. Coppolino  
Anthony J. Coppolino

*Attorneys for Federal Defendants  
in their Official Capacities*

1  
2                   **DECLARATION PURSUANT TO GENERAL ORDER 45, § X.B**

3                   I, ANTHONY J. COPPOLINO, hereby declare pursuant to General Order 45, § X.B, that  
4 I have obtained the concurrence in the filing of this document from each of the other signatories  
5 listed below.

6                   I declare under penalty of perjury that the foregoing declaration is true and correct.

7                   Executed on June 26, 2007, in the City of Washington, District of Columbia.

8                   PETER D. KEISLER  
9                   Assistant Attorney General, Civil Division  
10                  CARL J. NICHOLS  
11                  Deputy Assistant Attorney General  
12                  DOUGLAS N. LETTER  
13                  Terrorism Litigation Counsel  
14                  JOSEPH H. HUNT  
15                  Director, Federal Programs Branch  
16                  ANTHONY J. COPPOLINO  
17                  Special Litigation Counsel  
18                  RUPA BHATTACHARYYA  
19                  Senior Trial Counsel  
20                  ANDREW H. TANNENBAUM  
21                  ALEXANDER K. HAAS  
22                  Trial Attorneys  
23                  U.S. Department of Justice  
24                  Civil Division, Federal Programs Branch  
25                  20 Massachusetts Avenue, N.W., Rm. 7328  
26                  Washington, DC 20001  
27                  Telephone: (202) 514-4782 — Fax: (202) 616-8460  
28                  Email: tony.coppolino@usdoj.gov

19                  By: s/ Anthony J. Coppolino  
20                  Anthony J. Coppolino

21                  *Attorneys for Federal Defendants  
in their Official Capacities*

22                  By: s/ Shayana Kadidal  
23                  Shayana Kadidal  
24                  CENTER FOR CONSTITUTIONAL RIGHTS  
25                  666 Broadway, 7th Floor  
26                  New York, NY 10012-2317  
27                  (212) 614-6438

28                  Attorneys for Plaintiffs

## [PROPOSED] ORDER

Pursuant to the foregoing stipulation, and good cause appearing, it is hereby ORDERED that:

1. On June 8, 2007, Defendants in *CCR* filed a supplemental brief setting forth any additional points and authority concerning the status and disposition of the *CCR* case (07-cv-1115).
2. On or before July 6, 2007, Plaintiffs in *CCR* will file a response to the Government's submission and their own supplemental points and authority in support of their position on the pending motions.
3. Defendants will file a reply brief by ~~July 27, 2007~~ July 19, 2007
4. On August 9, 2007, at 2 p.m., oral argument will be held on the pending motions in the *CCR* case (07-cv-1115).

IT IS SO ORDERED.

Dated: June 28, 2007.

